Lesson 8: Restoration:

Unity & Division (1832–1900)

Slide 1 – [www.TheRestorationMovement.com](http://www.TheRestorationMovement.com)

Slide 2 – Lesson 7 in your program – but really Lesson 8 in the series. Sorry for confusion – Restoration: Unity & Division 1832-1900

Slide 3 – Alexander Campbell came to Kentucky in the spring of 1824. He met two very important people in his life. One was Raccoon John Smith. Smith was a Baptist minister who was struggling with the Calvinist teachings of his church. When he came across the writings of Campbell, he soaked them up like a sponge. When Campbell was scheduled to preach at Flemingsburg. Smith made the trip over from his Mt. Sterling home and attended. After the Irish preacher was finished, his friend sitting next to him asked him how he like Campbell’s preaching. He said, “Is it not hard, brother Billy, to ride twenty miles, as I have done, just to hear a man preach for thirty minutes?” To which his friend responded. You need to check your watch. He looked at it and noted Campbell had been preaching 2 ½ hours. Holding the watch up he said, "I have never been more deceived. Two hours of my life are gone, I know not how, though wide awake, too, all the time!" (Biography, J.A. Williams, page 164)

The other person he met on that trip was the Christian preacher, Barton W. Stone. Together they sat and talked for hours of the similarities of their own ministry. Over the next six years they continued to meet, to write back and forth, and to discuss the Scriptures. In short, it was determined that there was little need for the two groups, Christians and Disciples to stay apart. Smith represented the movement of the Disciples in a meeting at Hill Street Christian church on January 1st, 1832, where they extended the right hand of fellowship with B.W. Stone’s Christian Movement.

It was on this occasion that Smith was reported as saying, “Let us, then, my,, brethren, be no longer Campbellites or Stoneites, New Lights or Old Lights, or any other kind of lights, but let us all come to the Bible, and to the Bible alone, as the only book in the world that can give us all the Light we need.” (Biography, J.A. Williams, page 454).

Slide 4 – The Good News Spread

When unity was determined, the churches of the movement were vast and far spread. During The Years 1832 & 1833 John Rogers & Raccoon John Smith Were Selected To Travel Throughout The Region To Make People Aware That Union Had Taken Place. They continued for an additional year together to encourage the churches to merge. It was difficult, as hard feelings between the two in some communities existed. When Stone moved to Jacksonville, Illinois in 1843, there was a Christian church there and a Disciples church. They both asked him to preach for them. He said he’d preach for neither until they merged. They merged. This was not an easy process.

Slide 5 – The Printing Press Helped Merge The Works

- B.W. Stone’s *Christian Messenger* 1826 & A. Campbell’s *Christian* Baptist 1823, Distributed The Message Of Union Among Christians, Campbell had separated completely from the Baptists by 1830, so he closed the Christian Baptist, and started the Millennial Harbinger that same year. Later Others Like *Firm Foundation* & *Gospel Advocate*  Continued The Unity Call

- In December, 1835, A.C.’s *Millennial Harbinger* listed 10 RM papers.

Slide 6 – Some Highlights Over The Next Few Years

In 1835 The “Disciple’s Hymn Book” Is Distributed Bearing The Names Of B.W. Stone, Alexander Campbell, Walter Scott & John T. Johnson

1836 – A. Campbell publishes *The Christian System*

1836 – Bacon College Begins With Walter Scott As First President (Seeds of University Of Kentucky – 1858)

1841 – Bethany College Begins

1844 – Nov. 9, B.W. Stone Dies In Hannibal, Missouri

Slide 7 – Missions Controversy

* The Cooperation Meeting.
  + 1831-1832 Campbell pub. series of 7 articles in Millennial Harbinger on “The Cooperation of Churches.”
    - Believed world would never be evangelized unless churches cooperated in some way.
    - The 7 articles were a plea for cooperation, but NOT organization, believing churches could work together without societies
  + Some disagreed with any kind of cooperation, that it would lead to organization, like presidents, treasurers and secretaries, etc.

Slide 8 – The Bible Society – brainchild of D.S. Burnet (1808-1867)

* 1845 - 1st brotherhood organization  
  — American Christian Bible Society,   
  Cincinnati, Ohio
  + D. S. Burnet, Cincinnati, took lead.
  + Purpose: “to aid in the distribution of the Sacred Scriptures” throughout the world.   
     -(Christian Review – 1845, page 80)
  + Constitution (Burnet) called for officers, an annual meeting, and auxiliary societies.
  + Burnet, the president, called it a “holy cause” which should “enlist all our affections.”

Slide 9 – The Missionary Society

* Bible Society got support from most   
  periodicals, but Campbell   
  opposed it in the *MH*.
  + Reason: Was organized by a few Cincinnati brethren rather than a general convention.
  + Arthur Crihfield later said that if it “had commenced at Bethany,” Campbell would not have opposed.
  + There was controversy among periodicals.
  + Campbell and Burnett were friends, but Campbell did not relent in opposition.

Slide 10 – American Christian Missionary Society

* 1849 Campbell renewed efforts to persuade brotherhood of need for “a more efficient organization.”
* Obviously serious problems in proposal.
  + How could independent churches hold a convention?
  + Who could call it?
  + Where would it be held?
  + Would the brotherhood accept it?

Slide 11 – ACMS

* Periodicals discussed the issue through 1849.
* There seemed to be a Gradual consensus among writers
* General convention of the Bible Society at Cincinnati October 23, 1849.
* 10 states, 156 present--many   
  prominent preachers, but not Campbell.
* Campbell’s views presented by his son-in-law, W. K. Pendleton.
* Generally understood that one action of the convention would be the organization of a missionary society, but how it would be related to Bible society not clear.
* Reorganize Bible society to   
  include a “missionary department.”
  + would not have won Campbell’s approval.
* Pendleton proposed independent missionary society as “chief object of importance.”
  + this would have offended many who supported Bible society.

Slide 12 -

* D. S. Burnet presided and helped   
  draft the constitution for ACMS.
  + No surprise that constitution was   
    patterned after that of the Bible society.
  + Consisted of Annual Delegates, Life Members and Life Directors.
  + Life Member=$20; Life Director=$100.
  + Pres., 20 vice presidents, two secretaries, treasurer, managers, an annual meeting and an executive board.
  + Final action was to authorize letter to A.C. informing him he was president.
  + Campbell answered that his expectations were “more than realized.”
  + He withdrew his objections to Bible society now that it had been endorsed by the brotherhood.
  + Campbell also accepted presidency and served in the office for the rest of life (1849-1866).

Slide 13 – The First Work of the ACMS

* 1st work of society--sent Dr. James T. Barclay, Scottsville, VA, to Jerusalem.
  + Walter Scott said there was “magic in the name of Jerusalem.”
  + Brotherhood responded eagerly.
* Barclays arrived in 1850.
  + Work discouraging.
  + Discontinued in 1853 as Crimean War loomed.
  + Spent most time producing a geography on Bible Lands – “The City Of The Great King”
* Alexander Cross, freed slave, to Liberia, and J. O. Beardslee to Jamaica.

Slide 14 - Reaction To ACMS Came Quickly

* Followed by a decade of opposition.
* ACMS never had support of all brotherhood.
* Jacob Creath, Jr. the most   
  outspoken early critic.
* Campbell in 1823 in CB had said NT churches “were not fractured into missionary societies.” *-*The Christian Baptist, “The Christian Religion,” 1823, page 14.
* Campbell said, “They (NT Church) knew nothing of the *hobbies* of modern times.”ibid
* Further, Campbell had said that they dared not “transfer to a missionary society, or Bible society, or education society, *a cent or a prayer*, lest in so doing they should rob the church of its glory, and exalt the inventions of men above the wisdom of God. *In their church capacity alone they moved.”  
   -*From The Christian Baptist, “The Christian Religion,” 1823, page 15
* Creath reminded Campbell of   
  these earlier views.
* Said, “If you were right in the   
  *Christian Baptist*, you are wrong   
  now. If you are right now,   
  you were wrong then.”
* Creath also said supporters of society had “totally abandoned” the rule that “the Bible alone is the religion of Protestants.”

Slide 15 – Tolbert Fanning’s Reaction

* Biggest opponent in pre-Civil War   
  years was Tolbert Fanning.
  + Fanning (1810-1874) spent his   
    adult life in Nashville.
  + Most influential preacher in South in 1850s and 1860s.
  + Talented, with diverse interests.
    - Founded Tennessee Agricultural Society.
    - Edited the *Agriculturalist.*
* Founded Franklin College 1845,   
  trained many preachers, and edited journals.
* When ACMS founded, Fanning was elected the 9th vice-pres., though   
  not present in Cincinnati.
  + Supported society during early years.
  + Gradually came to question it.
  + Founded *Gospel Advocate* 1855 with “chief purpose” to examine the subjects of church organization and Christian cooperation.
* Spirit of early articles in *Gospel Advocate* strikingly similar to Campbell’s *Christian Baptist*
  + Fanning “The Church of God is the only divinely authorized Missionary, Bible, Sunday School and Temperance Society; the only institution in which the Heavenly Father will be honored . . . and through no other agency can man glorify his Maker.”-Gospel Advocate, 1857, page 69
  + Wrong for Christians to “do the work of the church through merely human agencies.” – Ibid.
* In years before Civil War a majority of Southern Christians came to share Fanning’s views.
  + But as yet no sense of alienation from society.
  + 1859 Fanning attended annual convention in Cincinnati.
    - Invited to address convention.
    - Described mission work in TN.
* Fanning took opportunity to say that many Southern Christians could not conscientiously support society.
  + Described how TN churches cooperated “as churches, without the aid of a Missionary Society” to support J.J. Trott in his work among Cherokee Indians.
  + Said, “But I am happy to say, that from what I have heard on this floor, we are one people. With us all there is one faith, one God, one body and one Spirit.”  
     -Gospel Advocate, 1859, p.329-333
* As Civil War loomed, Restoration Movement had also reached a crossroad.
  + Christians North & South held opposing views on an important doctrinal issue--
    - Whether missionary society scriptural.
    - But as yet, these differences had produced no sense of division.
* Nails were put in the ACMS coffin as far as churches in the South were concerned with the 1861 condemnation of the South.

Slide 16 – Continual Development of the ACMS

* 1869 – Attempts to reorganize in Louisville, Ky. “Louisville Plan”
  + Delegates elected from local churches to serve at district meetings
  + Delegates elected at district meetings to serve at state society.
  + Money followed a similar structure from local to state to national support.
    - District kept half the money, sent rest to state
    - State kept half the money, sent rest to national
    - Result: Little money made it to national level. After salaries paid, no money left for missions.
* By 1872 Louisville Plan was seen as a failure.

Slide 17 – Further Mission Organization

* 1874 – Christian Women’s Board Of Missions
* 1875 – Foreign Christian Missionary Society
* 1919 – These along with the ACMS merged into one body: The United Christian Missionary Society

Slide 18 – The Incident At Midway – Instrumental music. Tell the story.

Slide 19 – Early Controversy over the instrument – A. Campbell in an article in the MH, October, 1851 said that the use of IM in worship was “to all spiritually minded Christians, such aids would be as a cow bell in a concert.”

Slide 20 – Benjamin Franklin’s Opposition

* *American Christian Review*
* In Vol. III, #5, Jan. 31, 1860 page 19, stated that those who use instrumental music in worship never had or had lost the Spirit Of Christ. “Instrumental Music in Churches”
* Feb. 28th – Followed up with another stinging article called “Instrumental Music In Churches.”

Slide 21 – Controversy Over Music

* Three groups developed in the years that followed Midway
  + Supporters of ACMS and IM – prompted the founding of the *Christian Standard* in 1866 by Isaac Errett (Cincinnati, OH)
  + Supporters of ACMS but against IM – J.W. McGarvey & Moses Lard (*Apostolic Times, beg. 1869*) (Lexington, KY)

Supporters of Neither ACMS or IM – Tolbert Fanning, David Lipscomb, (*Gospel Advocate*) (Nashville, TN) Benjamin Franklin (*American Christian Review*) (Anderson, IN)

Slide 22 – March, 1864 Lard’s Quarterly

“In what light must we view him who attempts to introduce it into the churches of Christ of the present day? I answer, as an insulter of the authority of Christ, and as a defiant and impious innovator on the simplicity and purity of the ancient worship. In no other light can we view him, in no other light should he be viewed.” “Instrumental Music,” Lard’s Quarterly, 1864, p.331

Slide 23 – 1881, Apostolic Times – J.W. McGarvey

“I hold that the use of the instrument is sinful, and I must not be requested to keep my mouth shut in the presence of sin, whether committed by a church or an individual.” Apostolic Times, 1881, p., 4,10

Slide 24 – Prevalence Of Instrumental Music Being Used.

* 1868 Ben Franklin hazarded the guess that there were ten thousand congregations in the brotherhood,  and not over fifty of them had used the instrument in worship.” –Benjamin Franklin, as quoted by Earl West, Search For The Ancient Order, Vol. 2, page 80,81.
* 1878 – David Lipscomb wrote, “Those who introduce instrumental music give up the heart worship of Christ for the formalism of Judaism.” -*Gospel Advocate*, 1878, pgs. 457-458

Slide 25 – “The Cathedral” 1872 Central Christian Church in Cincinnati, Ohio

* Feb. 11 – Dedication of the church house was the largest in Cincinnati and seated 2,000. It cost $140,000 (about $2.25 million today). In addition to the lavish building, many were disturbed at an organ that cost $8,000 ($125,000 today). Shortly after the dedication, they gave a concert and charged admission.   
  – Ancil Jenkins, *Gospel Advocate*, “1906 Division Background of the Division of 1906

Slide 26 – The Church During The Civil War

* War began April 12, 1861
* During War Many Lost Their Faith
* Many Enlisted In The Military, Preachers Became Chaplains
* Many Journals Ceased Publication incl. *GA*
* October, 1861 – Biggest Wedge Was When The Missionary Society Condemned The South, Southern Brethren Were Appalled

Slide 27 – The Church After The Civil War

* Many Issues That Were Before The War Started Up Again
* Alexander Campbell Died March 4, 1866
* The Gospel Advocate Restarted In 1866 With Tolbert Fanning And A Young David Lipscomb As Co-Editors
* Over The Next 40 Years The Society And Instrument Continue To Destroy Unity.
* In The 1906 U.S. Census The Church of Christ And The Christian Church Was Recognized As Different Entities

Slide 28 – Theological Liberalism Developed in the brotherhood

* 1869 – L.L. Pinkerton started the *Christian Monthly*, in which he denounced plenary verbal inspiration of the Bible
* 1889 – Dr. R.C. Cave of St. Louis, dropped a bombshell in a sermon when he denounced both the virgin birth and the bodily resurrection of Christ.
* 1889 – J.S. Lamar wrote of his favor to accept the unimmersed into fellowship of the church.

Slide 29 – The Firm Foundation

* Austin McGary, Texas preacher begins the *The Firm Foundation* magazine to attack prevalence among some to accept into fellowship those immersed for any cause and from denominations.
* In his first issue he attacked the writings of T.R. Burnett & John T. Poe
* 2nd Issue his crosshairs were on David Lipscomb and *The Gospel Advocate*

Slide 30 – Sand Creek Meeting

* August 18, 1889, Shelby County, Illinois
* An annual gathering place of conservative Disciples since 1871
* Above 6000 in attendance
* Daniel Sommer (1850-1940) presented the gospel in two speeches
  + Speech one outlined the differences that took place within the disciples movement
  + Speech two, in the afternoon, was an evangelistic sermon
  + A formal signing of a written declaration to separate from liberal Disciples was signed
* Sommer discussed the intention  
  of the “Declaration and Address” of  
  September 7, 1809 by T. Campbell
* He reviewed the distinctive position of Disciples between faith and opinion, and between testimony and inference
* He then discussed the effect it had on the Disciples - - Two Different Approaches Since 1832
  + Men who held that the plea for unity at all costs was paramount
  + Men who regarded the restoration principle as paramount
* Lastly, a bold charge that the former had abandoned soundness, and through innovation had “produced evils plaguing the brotherhood”
* Sommer Charged — Disciples Innovations Included:
  + One-Man Pastorates
  + Missionary Societies
  + Modern Methods of Raising Money
    - Ladies Festival in one Ohio church to raise money for curtains and carpet for the meetinghouse
    - Children with “brown jugs on begging expeditions”
    - Box Suppers and Pound Parties
  + Instrumental Music In Worship

Claimed That Urban Churches Were The Main Culprits In This Departure

Slide 31 – Spreadsheet On Breakdown of the Movement

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Class** | **Conservatives** | **Liberals** |
| **Religious Authority** | **Faith/Testimony** | **Opinion/Inference** |
| **Church Government** | **Plurality Of Bishops** | **One-Man Pastorate** |
| **Preaching The Gospel** | **Through The Church** | **Through Missionary Society** |
| **Finances** | **Giving Through Simplicity** | **Fairs, Festivals & Begging** |
| **Music** | **Congregational Singing** | **Instrumental Music** |
| **Character of Members** | **Poor, pious, simple, humble, peace-loving, honest** | **Rich, shameless, arrogant, divisive, “usurpers of other men’s labors”** |

Slide 32 – Seven Signs That Brought About Separation

* Tears Shed By Loyal Christians
* Angry and unchristian words and  
  actions from liberals
* Strifes and alienations
* Divisions
* Lost opportunities to save souls
* Expenditures of time, money and strength
* Feuds, “heartburning and heartbreaking”